

ACDE Project: Bachelor Degrees in Education Threshold Learning Outcomes

OCTOBER 2011

Dr Greg Heath ALTC Discipline Scholar in Education
Faculty of Education La Trobe University

1. Background to the Project

The ALTC funded and ACDE sponsored project to establish Threshold Learning Outcomes (TLOs) at Masters level (AQF level 9), the ALTC Learning and Teaching Academic Standards Project (LTAS), is now complete. The project was grounded in consultation with many stakeholders in education across all states and territories of Australia and has produced a statement of the “Nature and Extent of the Discipline” and six threshold learning outcomes that will guide course development and assist in the TEQSA standards process. The booklets and website are now available for use by the education discipline community.

The ALTC is now closed and some of its functions have been taken over by the Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations (DEEWR) and the Tertiary Education TEQSA. However, the crucial role of leading innovation and change in learning and teaching has fallen by the wayside.

The LTAS “Discipline Scholar Project” serves as a useful model to follow for the task of extending Threshold Learning Outcome statements to level 7 (and 8) in the discipline of education. A number of disciplines are pursuing follow-up projects sponsored by dean’s councils or discipline networks. These include law, business, sociology and theology. Also, the Discipline Scholar Network continues, hosted now by the University of Tasmania, with meetings planned for November 2011 and throughout next year.

AQF Level 7, Bachelor level, qualifications in education are primarily Bachelor of Education or Bachelor of Teaching degrees that serve the dual purposes of providing a foundational education in the discipline and preparing graduates to meet the national registration requirements for beginning teachers established by AITSL and state registration authorities. There are also a number of double degrees and graduate Bachelor of Education degrees at Australian universities. There also exist some degrees that major in education studies such as Bachelor of Arts (Education) or Bachelor of Education Studies which do not qualify graduates for initial teacher registration. These are most often three-year degrees and often constitute an exit point for students not wishing to follow a career in teaching.

It should be noted that many graduates who complete a degree in the discipline of education do not choose to follow a career in the field of teaching or even in the broad field of education. Many students who complete a bachelor degree in education find a career path other than teaching or indeed in the education sector. A 2007 survey found that 30% of teacher education course graduates do not go into teaching and other figures show that a significant number of teachers leave the profession for other career paths within the first five years. In the majority of cases this a matter of choice as an education degree provides a very sound suite of knowledge, skills and capabilities which equip graduates well for roles

that require higher level “people skills” and “presentation skills” in areas involving communication, leadership, teamwork, planning and management.

A number of universities also offer honours degrees in education. These are AQF level 8 qualifications and whilst they normally qualify graduates for initial teacher registration, honours degrees are more frequently undertaken by students intending to embark on postgraduate research degrees. Whilst AQF level 8 qualifications are not the focus of this project a separate statement about the learning outcomes for honours degrees is made later in the document.

Students normally undertake bachelor degrees in education with the intention of finding employment in the field of education, usually in teaching, although a significant percentage of graduates find employment in settings other than education such as, corporate communications, human resources or business management.

1.1. Rationale - Professional Registration Standards and Threshold Learning Outcomes

The purpose of the project is to define Threshold or minimum learning outcomes in the discipline of education that could be expected of graduates in bachelor degrees in education. The award of bachelor degree is testament to the completion of a course of study in a particular field with a broad and coherent knowledge of the discipline. A bachelor degree sets out to achieve two major objectives, a) to provide a sound educational foundation for personal growth and maturity to position graduates for further learning and b) to provide a broad theoretical and practical grounding in a discipline sufficient to permit entry into a profession or related discipline community. In the context of this broad definition the purposes of a bachelor degree in education lead to learning outcomes that are broader than the learning outcomes required for initial teacher registration. It is important that whilst being contextually relevant to the current state of knowledge and practice in education that these TLOs recognise the need to prepare graduates for an environment of continuing rapid, social, cultural and technological change. Preparation for a high degree of professional flexibility and resilience needs to be an integral part of future education courses.

However, given the importance of preparation for the teaching profession the TLOs are written, in part, with a view to graduates who meet these learning outcomes also being expected to meet the registration requirements for commencing teachers. Thus they are matched closely to, and mapped across, the Graduate Teacher Standards established by AITSL -*National Professional Standards for Teachers*. The AITSL Graduate Teacher Standards “make explicit the professional expectations of those graduating from initial teacher education programs.”

These TLOs have been developed in the context of the education discipline and informed by professional practitioners and researchers. They are not Professional Standards, and do not replace or replicate Professional Standards, but specify Threshold Learning Outcomes for bachelor degrees in education.

The TLOs are also benchmarked against a number of international standards, in particular QAA Scotland, QAA England and Wales, Tuning-Europe and the NBPTS United States.

1.2. The AITSL National Professional Standards for Teachers

The AITSL *National Professional Standards for Teachers*, incorporate the following Graduate Teacher Standards:

- On successful completion of their initial teacher education, graduate teachers possess the requisite knowledge and skills to plan for and manage learning programs for students.
- They demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the implications for learning of students' physical, cultural, social, linguistic and intellectual characteristics. They understand principles of inclusion and strategies for differentiating teaching to meet the specific learning needs of students across the full range of abilities.
- Graduate teachers have an understanding of their subject/s, curriculum content and teaching strategies. They are able to design lessons that meet the requirements of curriculum, assessment and reporting. They demonstrate the capacity to interpret student assessment data to evaluate student learning and modify teaching practice. They know how to select and apply timely and appropriate types of feedback to improve students' learning.
- Graduate teachers demonstrate knowledge of practical strategies for creating rapport with students and managing student behaviour. They know how to support students' well-being and safety working within school and system curriculum and legislative requirements.
- They understand the importance of working ethically, collaborating with colleagues, external professional and community representatives, and contributing to the life of the school. Teachers understand strategies for working effectively, sensitively and confidentially with parents/carers and recognise their role in their children's education.

These standards provide clear statements of academic attainment that are required to meet the professional standards for initial registration as a teacher in Australia.

However, there remains the underlying question of what learning outcomes graduates will need to achieve in order to meet the professional standards for teachers. For instance, it can legitimately be asked what learning outcomes need to be achieved in order to for graduates to meet the Professional Standard 1 "Know students and how they learn"; clearly this requires students to know something of individual differences, learning theory, human development and much more.

A statement of these learning outcomes will assist course designers and other academic staff to design and deliver courses that both meet the requirements of the teaching profession and offer a coherent and balanced education in the discipline.

1.3. Australian Qualification Framework (AQF)

The revised Australian Qualifications Framework (AQF) 2011 provides a statement of the generic learning outcomes that graduates of level 7 courses offered by Higher Education Providers are expected to meet. These are framed around knowledge, skills and the application of knowledge and skills. The AQF Bachelors Degree specification states, "a broad and coherent body of knowledge, with depth in the underlying principles and concepts in

one or more disciplines as a basis for independent lifelong learning.” These generic descriptors need to be adapted for each discipline or professional learning area. The revised AQF now forms an essential part of the TEQSA “Qualifications” Threshold Standard.

2. Differentiation of Level 7 from Level 9

The project differentiates the TLOs in both level and nature from those covered in the previous LTAS Level 9 project. The differentiation reflects the fact that Masters students are building on a base of 3 or 4 years of undergraduate study and could be expected to display greater capacity for the development of specialised, advanced or complex knowledge and skills. They could also be expected to display superior judgement and leadership and a greater capacity for self-directed learning and autonomous practice. The AQF descriptors clearly state that masters graduates will have “advanced”, “expert” and “specialised” knowledge and skills as the result of a process of learning. The AQF Masters Degree specification states:

The purpose the Masters Degree (coursework) is to qualify individuals who apply an advanced body of knowledge in range of contexts for professional practice or scholarship and as a pathway to further learning.

Students undertaking masters courses generally fit into one of three categories, either a) they are already qualified for initial teacher registration and are seeking to specialise or upgrade their knowledge and skills, or b) not being qualified for teacher registration they are undertaking masters level study personal enrichment or for a professional role outside teaching, these students normally undertake a Master of Education degree or c) graduates of bachelor degrees who are seeking to enter the teaching profession with a two-year postgraduate qualification, these students normally undertake a Master of Teaching Degree. Recent changes to requirements for entry into the teaching profession requiring a minimum of two years study of the theory and practice of teaching will see a significant increase in the number of students in the latter category.

By contrast the great majority of students undertaking bachelor level courses do so with the intention of working within the education sector as a teacher, or alternatively in a role such as educational designer, or in professional development or in skills coaching.

The level 7 TLOs project provides a basis for HEPs to design courses which both have an academic coherence in their own right and compliment the work recently completed by AITSL on Graduate Teacher Standards.

At the current time due to new AQF and AITSL requirements there are entry points into the teaching profession with level 7, 8 and 9 qualifications leading to anomalies in the levels of learning outcomes which lead to the same professional entry point.

2.1 TLOs at AQF Level 7

At level 7 graduates will have a sound and coherent knowledge-base which provides a firm grounding for their professional practice as a teacher or for another professional role in education. Graduate entry teachers will meet learning outcomes required for entry into the education profession, broadly conceived.

The AQF generic specification for level 7 states:

Graduates of a Bachelor Degree will have a broad and coherent body of knowledge, with depth and underlying principles and concepts in one or more disciplines as a basis for independent lifelong learning.

This generic specification needs to be articulated in terms of the education discipline. The specific knowledge, and the cognitive, creative, critical, technical, communicative and practical skills need to be specified in the context of education.

An essential element of learning outcomes at level 7 is the ability to continue further professional learning for becoming more expert as a teacher and gaining professional advancement. The ability to continue further learning and professional development is most important for graduate teachers as it equips them to follow their career through to Lead Teacher or to the classification of Principal.

The four career stages for teachers as defined by AITSL are:

- Graduate teacher
- Proficient teacher
- Highly Accomplished teacher
- Lead teacher

The AITSL descriptors recognise “the professional growth of teachers throughout their careers.” Thus it is essential that bachelor courses in education lay down strong foundations for further learning and professional development. Thus the TLOs relate to the AITSL Graduate teacher level, but not exclusively so. In some cases the TLOs are set to enable teachers to move to the Proficient or Highly Accomplished levels and relate more closely to the AITSL descriptors for those levels.

The TLOs for level 7 will reference the AQF descriptors and AITSL Professional Learning Outcomes. They will provide statements of what knowledge, skills and understandings a graduate of a bachelor level course in education needs to meet in order to achieve a satisfactory set of learning outcomes in the discipline of Education and to meet Graduate teacher professional standards.

2.2 AQF Level 8

AQF level 8 covers a range of rather diverse qualifications. They are Bachelors Honours Degrees, Graduate Certificates, Graduate Diplomas and Vocational Graduate Certificates and Graduate Diplomas. Whilst the pathways policy requires completion of level 7 (or equivalent) as the entry level for each of these qualifications, they have different purposes and thus different learning outcomes. What they have in common, however is that they all require a higher level of knowledge, skills and judgement than level 7.

The AQF generic descriptor for bachelor honours degree specifies depth in a specialised area and preparation for research as well as for a profession or further learning. In the context of the education discipline there is a tension here between the requirement for depth in a research specialisation and coverage of the broad learning areas required for the teaching profession. Thus many honours students are seeking a pathway to a higher research degree rather than immediate entry into the profession.

3. Threshold Learning Outcomes for Education for Bachelor Courses in Education

The TLOs focus on bachelor level courses in education and specify what knowledge, skills and capabilities a graduate will achieve as a result of completing a bachelor level qualification in education. The TLOs reference the depth and coherence of knowledge, creative, analytical and critical capacities, communication and professional practice competencies that are expected of a person with this degree of study in education. They also acknowledge and take into account the AITSL Domains of Teaching; Professional Knowledge, Professional Practice and Professional Engagement.

TLO 1 - Knowledge

Graduates know and understand learning and learners through the history, philosophies, sociology and current issues and practices of education. They also know and understand the physical, social and emotional dimensions of learners and learning and appreciate the importance of developmental learning contexts.

Graduates have knowledge and understanding of education policies, appropriate curricula, learning theory and practice, Indigenous Australian and other cultures. In addition they know education theory and practice from a global perspective. They also know and understand of the discipline and the profession of education, and have particular knowledge of their field of education and/or teaching discipline(s) and the learning theory and practice relevant in that field or discipline.

TLO 2 - Skills

Graduates have cognitive, analytical, critical, creative and professional practice skills necessary for entry into the education profession or other related professional pathway. These skills and abilities will enable the development of critically reflective practitioners who are responsive to complex learning contexts. They will be able to design, deliver and evaluate and report on programs for effective learning.

TLO 3 – Application of Knowledge and Skills

Graduates synthesise theoretical understanding and practical skills to interpret community and individual learning needs, implement learning strategies, apply research findings, and integrate learning with assessment and feedback. They recognise the importance of leadership and collaboration in education settings.

They display innovation in the design, adaptation and implementation of effective learning in their areas of education or other related specialisation. They also exercise informed professional judgement in planning and decision making in professional practice.

TLO 4 - Communication

Graduates are literate across a broad range of communication modes and technologies, in educational contexts. Graduates understand the role of language and communication for education and learning. They communicate sensitively with diverse communities for positive educational outcomes for learners. They communicate effectively with allied professionals, advancing the interests of learners and communities.

TLO 5 - Professional Learning

Graduates have the capacity for independent, autonomous, self-directed learning. They understand the importance of self-motivation, and critically-reflective practice and engaging collaboratively to enhance self-knowledge and personal resilience. They seek and learn from constructive feedback and professional evaluation for further learning and professional advancement.

TLO 6 – Ethical and Responsible Professional Practice

Graduates adopt reflective practice, show respect for colleagues and community members and understand the importance of good judgement and sound decision-making. They display fair and equitable treatment of learners, understand underlying ethical principles such as equity and mutual respect, and apply the relevant professional code of ethics. They conduct their practice in educational settings in an ethical, collaborative, professional and accountable manner whilst valuing social, cultural and environmental sustainability

Also, graduates engage sensitively and ethically with all stakeholders across the field of education, working effectively with these stakeholders, including community members, colleagues, government and members of other professions. They can work across cultures, values and beliefs, understand social and policy issues and engage in current debates regarding policy and practice which impact on the broad field of education.

3.1 TLO –AITSL Comparison Tables

The AITSL *National Professional Standards for Teachers* were adopted in February 2011 and the related document *Accreditation of Initial Teacher Education Programs in Australia* was adopted in April 2011. This current table seeks to reference the Graduate Teacher standard Accreditation of Initial Teacher Education standards to the draft Threshold Learning Outcomes. It should be noted that AITSL has adopted three domains of teaching accompanied by seven standards which are each broken down into a number of “Focus areas”. The following table seeks to provide a “best fit” and not a sequential list of standards. The aim is to show that the seven TLOs for bachelor degrees in education will incorporate the AITSL standards

| Threshold Learning Outcome | TLO Descriptor | AITSL <i>National Professional Standards for Teachers</i> (selective list against TLOs) | AITSL <i>Accreditation of Initial Teacher Education Programs</i> (Full list in sequence for Graduate teachers) |
|----------------------------|---|--|---|
| TLO 1 – Knowledge | Graduates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> know and understand learning and learners through the history, philosophies, sociology and current issues and practices of education know and understand the physical, social and emotional dimensions of learners and learning know and appreciate the importance of developmental learning contexts have knowledge and understanding of education policies, appropriate curricula, learning theory and practice, Indigenous Australian and other cultures know education theory and practice from a global perspective | Graduates teachers: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1.2 - Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of research into how students learn and the implications for teaching 2.1 - Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the concepts, substance and structure of the content and teaching strategies of the teaching area. 1.1 - Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of physical, social and intellectual development and characteristics of students and how these may affect learning 2.5 - Demonstrate knowledge of literacy and numeracy strategies and their application in teaching areas 1.4 - Demonstrate broad knowledge of, understanding of and respect for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander histories, cultures | Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of physical, social and intellectual development and characteristics of students and how these may affect learning. Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of research into how students learn and the implications for teaching. Demonstrate knowledge of teaching strategies that are responsive to the learning strengths and needs of students from diverse linguistic, cultural, religious and socioeconomic backgrounds. Demonstrate broad knowledge and understanding of the impact of culture, cultural identity and linguistic background on the education of students from Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander backgrounds. Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of strategies for differentiating teaching to meet |

TLO 1 – Knowledge Continued...

- know and understand of the discipline and the profession of education
- have particular knowledge of their field of education and/or teaching discipline(s) and the learning theory and practice relevant in that field or discipline.

and languages

- **1.5** - Demonstrate knowledge and understanding understand of strategies for differentiating teaching to meet the specific learning needs of students across a full range of abilities
- **1.3**- Demonstrate knowledge of teaching strategies that are responsive to the learning strengths and needs of students from diverse linguistic, cultural, religious and socioeconomic backgrounds.
- **1.6** - Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the concepts, substance and structure of the content and teaching strategies of the teaching area.

the specific learning needs of students across the full range of abilities.

Demonstrate broad knowledge and understanding of legislative requirements and teaching strategies that support participation and learning of students with disability.

TLO 2 – Skills

Graduates have:

- Cognitive- analytical, critical, creative skills necessary for entry into the education profession or other related professional pathway
- Professional practice skills necessary for entry into the education profession or other related professional pathway.
- The skills and abilities to enable the development of critically reflective practitioners who are responsive to complex learning contexts

Graduate teachers can:

- **2.2** - Organise content into an effective learning and teaching sequence
- **2.3** - Use curriculum, assessment and reporting knowledge to design learning sequences and lesson plans.
- **4.1** - Identify strategies to support inclusive student participation and engagement in classroom activities.
- **4.4** - Describe strategies that support students' well-being and safety working within school and/or system, curriculum and legislative requirements.

Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the concepts, substance and structure of the content and teaching strategies of the teaching area.

Organise content into an effective learning and teaching sequence.

Use curriculum, assessment and reporting knowledge to design learning sequences and lesson plans.

Demonstrate broad knowledge of, understanding of and respect for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander histories, cultures and languages.

Know and understand literacy and numeracy teaching strategies and their application in

TLO 2 – Skills Continued...

- The ability to design, deliver and evaluate effective programs for learning.

teaching areas.

Implement teaching strategies for using ICT to expand curriculum learning opportunities for student

TLO 3 – Application of Knowledge and Skills

Graduates can:

- synthesise theoretical understanding and practical skills to interpret community and individual learning needs
- implement learning strategies, apply research findings,
- integrate learning with assessment and feedback
- recognise the importance of, and participate in leadership and collaboration in education settings.
- display innovation in the design, adaptation and implementation of effective learning in their areas of education or other related specialisation
- exercise informed professional judgement in planning and decision making in professional practice.

Graduate teachers can:

- **3.2** - Plan lesson sequences using knowledge of student learning, content and effective teaching strategies.
- **2.6** - implement teaching strategies using ICT to expand curriculum learning opportunities for students.
- **3.1** - Set learning goals that provide achievable challenges for students of varying abilities and characteristics.
- **2.2** Organise content into an effective learning and teaching sequence
- **1.6** design and support the participation and learning of students with disability

Set learning goals that provide achievable challenges for students of varying abilities and characteristics.

Plan lesson sequences using knowledge of student learning, content and effective teaching strategies.

Include a range of teaching strategies.

Demonstrate knowledge of a range of resources, including ICT, that engage students in their learning.

Demonstrate a range of verbal and non-verbal communication strategies to support student engagement.

Demonstrate broad knowledge of strategies that can be used to evaluate teaching programs to improve student learning.

Describe a broad range of strategies for involving parents/carers in the educative process.

Identify strategies to support inclusive student participation and engagement in classroom activities.

Demonstrate the capacity to organise classroom activities and provide clear

TLO 3 – Application of Knowledge and Skills
Continued...

directions.

Demonstrate knowledge of practical approaches to manage challenging behaviour
Describe strategies that support students' well-being and safety working within school and/or system, curriculum and legislative requirements.

Demonstrate an understanding of the relevant issues and the strategies available to support the safe, responsible and ethical use of ICT in learning and teaching.

TLO 4 - Communication

Graduates:

- are literate across a broad range of communication modes and technologies, in educational contexts
- understand the role of language and communication for education and learning
- communicate sensitively with diverse communities for positive educational outcomes for learners
- communicate effectively with allied professionals, advancing the interests of learner and communities.

Graduate teachers:

- **3.5** - Demonstrate a range of verbal and nonverbal communication strategies to support student engagement.
- **5.2** - Understand the purpose of providing timely and appropriate feedback to students about their learning
- **5.1** - Understand assessment strategies including informal and formal, diagnostic, formative and summative approaches to assess student learning
- **3.7** - Describe a broad range of strategies for involving parents/carers in the educative process.

Demonstrate understanding of assessment strategies, including informal and formal, diagnostic, formative and summative approaches to assess student learning.

Demonstrate an understanding of the purpose of providing timely and appropriate feedback to students about their learning.

Demonstrate understanding of assessment moderation and its application to support consistent and comparable judgements of student learning.

Demonstrate the capacity to interpret student assessment data to evaluate student learning and modify teaching practice.

Demonstrate understanding of a range of strategies for reporting to students and parents/carers and the purpose of keeping accurate and reliable records of student achievement.

TLO 5 - Professional Learning

Graduates:

- have the capacity for independent, autonomous, self-directed learning
- understand the importance of self-motivation, and critically-reflective practice
- engage collaboratively to enhance self-knowledge and personal resilience
- seek and learn from constructive feedback and professional evaluation for further learning and professional advancement.

Graduate teachers:

- **6.2** - Understand the relevant and appropriate sources of professional learning for teachers.
- **6.4** - Demonstrate an understanding of the rationale for continued professional learning and the implications for improved student learning.
- **6.3** - Seek and apply constructive feedback from supervisors and teachers to improve teaching practices

Demonstrate an understanding of the role of the National Professional Standards for Teachers in identifying professional learning needs.

Understand the relevant and appropriate sources of professional learning for teachers.

Seek and apply constructive feedback from supervisors and teachers to improve teaching practices.

Demonstrate an understanding of the rationale for continued professional learning and the implications for improved student learning.

TLO 6 – Ethical and Responsible Professional Practice

Graduates:

- adopt reflective practice, show respect for colleagues and community members
- understand the importance of good judgement and sound decision-making
- display fair and equitable treatment of students or clients
- understand underlying ethical principles such as equity and mutual respect
- apply the relevant professional code of ethics
- conduct their practice in education settings in an ethical, collaborative,

Graduate teachers:

- **5.5** - Demonstrate understanding of a range of strategies for reporting to students and parents/carers and the purpose of keeping accurate and reliable records of student achievement.
- **7.1**- Understand and apply the key principles described in codes of ethics and conduct for the teaching profession
- **7.2** - Understand the relevant legislative, administrative and organisational policies and processes required for teachers according to school stage.
- **7.3** - Understand the strategies for working effectively, sensitively and confidently with parents/carers.

Understand and apply the key principles described in codes of ethics and conduct for the teaching profession.

Understand the relevant legislative, administrative and organisational policies and processes required for teachers according to school stage.

Understand strategies for working effectively, sensitively and confidentially with parents/carers.

Understand the role of external professionals and community representatives in broadening teachers' professional knowledge and practice.

TLO 6 – Ethical and Responsible Professional Practice Continued...

- professional and accountable manner
- value social and environmental sustainability, understand environmental issues and be able to contribute to education for sustainable development
 - engage sensitively and ethically with all stakeholders across the field of education
 - work effectively with these stakeholders, including parents/carers, colleagues, government and members of other professions
 - work across cultures, values and beliefs, understand social and policy issues and engage in current debates regarding policy and practice which impact on the broad field of education.

- **7.4** - Understand the role of external professionals and community representatives in broadening teachers' professional knowledge and practice.

4. Benchmarking

The practice of specifying learning outcomes and professional registration standards for teachers has become normal international practice in both developed and developing countries. The international comparisons of most relevance to the Australian setting are: QAA Scotland, QAA England and Wales, Graduating Teacher Standards Aotearoa/New Zealand, Tuning-Europe and the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS) United States. It must also be said that there are interesting developments in many other countries such as Indonesia, the Canadian Provinces and in South America. The New Zealand and United States standards take a similar approach to AITSL and the Australian states by specifying seven and five standards respectively outlining what it is teachers should know and be able to do, including a statement of the professional dispositions that are expected of good teachers.

Tuning-Europe takes a more discursive approach spelling out learning outcomes as generic and discipline specific competences that can be expected of graduates at each of the three higher education cycles. The QAA United Kingdom takes a different approach with the QAA Scotland, Standards for Initial Teacher Education (SITE) being of particular interest where the “benchmark information is based on a vision of the newly qualified teacher...”(QAA Scotland, p 1.).

Each of these statements has something to offer as background and context for a specification of TLOs at level 7.

4.1 QAA Scotland

The Scottish “Subject Benchmark Statement” is of interest because, like the Finnish National Board of Education “Learning and Competence 2020” statement, it adopts a future oriented approach to teacher education and learning outcomes. It recognises that it is not possible to anticipate in detail what knowledge, skills and competencies good teachers will require in future in such rapidly changing times, and states:

[The Benchmarks] *prepare student teachers to undertake progressively the professional duties required of teachers, and to reflect on the values and principles underpinning the curriculum, on the purposes of education, and on the nature of the education system, not only to respond to changes in the professional context, but also to contribute to that process of change.* (QAA 2007, Scottish Subject Benchmark Statement P. 3)

Emphasis is placed on “higher order” or more generic learning outcomes that will facilitate lifelong learning and career-long professional development. Thus, for instance, the benchmark statement emphasises as outcome/benchmark 1.3.1 the ability to, “Draw on relevant principles, perspectives and theories to inform professional values and practices.”¹

4.2 Tuning –Europe

Tuning Europe has produced a detailed statement for the education discipline *Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Education*² This statement provides a framework for the implementation of the three Bologna Cycles in the field of education. It provides broad statements designed to accommodate the range of higher education structures across the European signature countries. Typically, it specifies course structures, learning outcomes and competencies across the three degree cycles, Bachelor, Master and Doctor.

¹ Scottish subject benchmark statement: *The Standard for Initial Teacher Education* (2007), The Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education, Mansfield.

² Tuning –Europe (2009) *Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Education*, Publicaciones de la Universidad de Deusto, Bilbao.

The European model makes a strong distinction between “Education Sciences” and “Teacher Education”. Education Sciences refers to the study of education as a discipline in its own right with a strong evidence base to research and policy. Teacher Education has a strong component of pedagogical and methodological study with a stress on practice-based learning. The study of Education Sciences is usually seen as foundational to Teacher Education.

The broad approach taken by Tuning seeks to accommodate the broad range of initial teacher education requirements across Europe. For instance in Scandinavian and many other countries entry into the teaching profession at all levels, early childhood, primary, secondary, vocational and adult follows the completion of a second cycle (Masters) program and requires a minimum of five years study. In some other countries, such as England completion of the first cycle plus one year of intensive preparation in the field of education is required. The matter is further complicated by some countries accepting sub-degree qualifications in early childhood and some fields of vocational education.

Tuning First Cycle -Common to Both Teacher Education and Education Sciences/Studies

Many competences (generic and specific) are common to both teacher education and Education Sciences; some competences are specific to teacher education. Not all competences will be fully developed at the end of first cycle studies and will continue to develop over the continuum of professional life, often focused on during periods of in-service education and training, but not necessarily developed in a context of formal education.

Teachers and trainers should be able to work effectively in three overlapping areas, as should graduates of Education Sciences programmes. They should be able to:

- work with information and knowledge of subject to be taught, and of educational issues and their theoretical bases
- work with their fellow human beings - pupils/trainees, colleagues and other partners in education. This includes the ability to analyse complex situations concerning human learning and development in particular contexts ;
- work with society - at local, regional, national, European and broader global levels including the development of appropriate professional values and the ability to reflect on practices and contexts
- Abilities for reflection include the ability to reflect on their own and other's value systems, development and practices

Teacher Education

- competence in a number of teaching/learning and assessment strategies and understanding of their theoretical bases;
- ability to create an equal and fair climate conducive to learning for all learners regardless of their socio-cultural-economic context.

4.3 National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (NBPTS) United States

The NBPTS sets out five general propositions for adoption by School Boards across the United States. These propositions set out in general terms what it is that teachers should be able to know and do. Minimum entry qualifications for the teaching professions normally require a bachelors' degree with a significant component of education specific theory and practice but the requirements will vary from one state or county to another.

The Five Core Propositions

NBPTS was created in 1987 after the Carnegie Forum on Education and the Economy's Task Force on Teaching as a Profession released A Nation Prepared: Teachers for the 21st Century. This policy set forth our vision for accomplished teaching. The Five Core Propositions form the foundation and frame the rich amalgam of knowledge, skills, dispositions and beliefs that characterize National Board Certified Teachers (NBCTs).

Proposition 1:

Teachers are Committed to Students and Their Learning

Proposition 2:

Teachers Know the Subjects They Teach and How to Teach Those Subjects to Students.

Proposition 3:

Teachers are Responsible for Managing and Monitoring Student Learning.

Proposition 4:

Teachers Think Systematically about Their Practice and Learn from Experience.

Proposition 5:

Teachers are Members of Learning Communities.

APPENDIX 1 The Nature and Extent of the Discipline of Education

This statement was included in the ALTC booklet *Masters Degrees in Education*

To be educated is not to have arrived at a destination; it is to travel with a different view. -R S Peters³

Education as a discipline is essentially involved with the study of learning and teaching. It centres on the generation, acquisition, social construction and interchange of knowledge in all its theoretical and practical detail and complexity.

The discipline of Education is one of the founding disciplines of thought. It has a long history and tradition reaching deep into ancient scholarship. Education was discussed as a discrete field of knowledge and practice by Plato, Aristotle and Epicurus. It was a central topic of Roman scholarship and debate and has noble origins in Judaic, Islamic, Confucian and Indigenous traditions.

Today, in a competitive and globalised world where knowledge and advanced skills are increasingly valued, Education has taken on a new level of importance. It has become central to personal, social, cultural and economic success and has become a high policy priority for governments. Educated citizens are the foundation of strong, inclusive and democratic societies.

The field of Education represents the largest professional group in Australia. The Education and Training industry is the fourth largest in Australia. Employing 829,800 educators, it constitutes 7.6 % of the total workforce (DEEWR 2010). According to the Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations, over the last 10 years, employment in education and training rose by 205,300 (or 32.9 per cent), which represents an average annual growth rate of 2.9 per cent.⁴ The training and education industry has been one of Australia's fastest growing export sectors, contributing \$18.6 billion in export income to the Australian economy in 2009⁵. The contribution of the Education discipline is critical to this success.

There are currently approximately 45,000 EFT students enrolled in education degrees in Australian Universities (ACDE 2010).

The Nature of the Discipline

Education is a discrete discipline with its own traditions, bodies of knowledge, methodologies and communities of scholarship and practice. It is embedded in the family of disciplines that centres on political, philosophical, social, ethical, historical, cultural, psychological, and religious studies. However, Education is also a multi-disciplinary endeavour with links to all other disciplines as they necessarily involve the processes of learning and engagement with their own bodies of knowledge and forms of practice.

The Preparation of Professional Practitioners in Education

³ Peters, R. S.,(1965) *Education as Initiation*, in Archambault, R., *Philosophical Analysis and Education*, p. 110, New York, Humanities Press.

⁴ Employment Outlook for Education and Training' February 2010, DEEWR source: <http://www.skillsinfo.gov.au/NR/rdonlyres/5FCC8F9F-19E0-4AFA-9EA3-0C99B73ED0AB/0/OutlookEducationandTraining.pdf>

⁵ Australian Education International, May 2010, Research Snapshot: Export Income to Australia from Education Services in 2009, Australia

The core discipline of Education is founded on study and research in the theory and practice of learning, pedagogy, curriculum, and learning environments, as well as studies of the history, philosophy, sociology, psychology and politics of education.

The profession of Education, based on the practice of the discipline, is concerned with the development of knowledge in the discipline and preparation of professionals for a range of education settings and specialisations.

It has become common practice, as it is with the European Tuning Project, to divide the field of Education between the domains of *Education Sciences or Studies* and *Teacher Education*. This division is commonly made within the discipline and is understandable given the scale of the enterprise of teacher education, but this conceptualisation can be misleading in that teacher education is but one of many specialisations that find their foundations in the core discipline of Education.

Education is constituted by an extensive range of specialisations; which include the education of teachers and other professionals for:

- Early Childhood Education;
- Primary Education
- Middle Years Education; and
- Secondary Education.

It also includes the distinct fields of teacher professional learning for:

- Vocational Education and Adult Education,
- Workplace education and training
- Higher Education,
- and a range of professional development and lifelong learning specialisations, typified by leadership and management education.

There is a further long list of education specialisations which includes, but is not limited to, languages education, special education, Indigenous education, religious education, cultural and arts education, physical and outdoor education, environmental education, and counselling and outreach education.

The key concepts that define the domain of professional education are:

- curriculum** (essential knowledge, skills and capabilities),
- pedagogy** (approaches to learning and teaching, assessment, learning technologies),
- learning environments** (schools, early childhood settings, international settings, VET and Higher Education, workplaces and virtual learning environments),
- skills development** (cognitive, analytical and critical, practical, vocational, agency and leadership skills),
- communication** (verbal, written, visual, cross-cultural and use of communication technologies),
- personal and social development and transformation** (education for ethical, emotional and spiritual maturity and reflective judgement).

The Significance of the Discipline

The discipline of Education plays a new, critical and central role in a knowledge-based society. The key to economic success is increasingly to be found in a highly educated and sophisticated and increasingly globalised workforce. Similarly, the key to societal success is well-informed, active and empowered citizenry. As a result, many governments worldwide have been prepared to increase

financial investment in, and the commitment of policy and resources, to the development of education at all levels.

The discipline of Education is of major constitutive economic, social and political importance. It does more than any other field of academic endeavour to shape, maintain and transform the qualities of a community and to empower its members.

The discipline of Education facilitates pedagogical processes that develop capacities for reasoning, understanding and imagining the world; the capabilities for purposive action and interaction; and the wisdom to reflectively, critically and accountably judge the consequences of such action on the part of self and others.

Finally, the discipline of Education intrinsically values the development of personal autonomy and fulfilment that make for a rich order of being that ultimately makes life meaningful and worthwhile.

Appendix 2: Abbreviations

ACDE Australian Council of Deans of Education

AITSL Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership

ALTC Australian Learning and Teaching Council

AQF Australian Qualifications Framework

DEEWR Department of Employment, Education and Workplace Relations

DS Discipline Scholar

HEP Higher Education Provider

LTAS Learning and Teaching Academic Standards

NADLATE Network of Associate Deans of Learning and Teaching in Education

NBPTS National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (USA)

QAA Quality Assurance Agency (UK)

TEQSA Tertiary Education Quality and Standards Agency (Australia)

TLO threshold learning outcome

